

OPERATION EVALUATION

PAKISTAN PROTRACTED RELIEF AND RECOVERY OPERATION 200250

“ENHANCING FOOD AND NUTRITION SECURITY AND REBUILDING SOCIAL COHESION”

January 2013 to August 2014

Management Response

[December 2014]



World Food Programme

Management response cleared by:

Country Director: Lola Castro/ March 03, 2015

Detailed responses to evaluation recommendations

Evaluation Recommendations	Management Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
1. Recommendation 1: The Country Office (CO) should address gaps in the quality and coverage in the current management of acute malnutrition programme to ensure sustainable outcomes and a solid basis for future programming. WFP should continue to expand integrated programming through the existing government system and ensure uniform coverage within districts. In order to improve nutrition outcomes, the ration for acutely malnourished PLW should be changed to a lipid-based nutrient supplement (LNS) (<i>Maamta</i>) as soon as it becomes available.	Partially Accepted Programme has shown consistently good performance indicators (recovery, default, death) and will take these recommendations to continue making improvements on other programme parameters. Based on internal analysis and previous recommendations - Regional Bureau CMAM Case Study - CO does is not wholly in agreement with the proposed geographical expansion of CMAM (if that is in fact the recommendation), and would in fact scale down in terms of geographical locations and sites to increase focus on quality issues, and move towards a more preventive approach, and shifting the programme gradually to the government health structures. Within the same focus areas, the CO will ensure uniform coverage. The recommendation on the change to the PLW ration aligns with a change that has already been planned, and the process for which the CO initiated back in 2013. The shift will be made gradually based on the outcome of the LNS PLW	Improve quality and programme performance based on specific recommendations from coverage survey; prepare an action plan for implementation. In depth analysis on where and when to start downsizing sites and geographical locations.	Nutrition/PO	Jan-Dec	N
		Subject to results of study, field test the new LNS PLW product in two		May-Dec	N

Evaluation Recommendations	Management Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
	acceptability study that is already underway.	districts in Punjab.			
To ensure programme sustainability, WFP should give particular attention to supporting the Lady Health Workers (LHWs) and Lady Health Volunteers (LHVs) through development of: i) a simplified protocol in Urdu for Severe Acute Malnutrition (SAM) and Moderately Acute Malnutrition (MAM) treatment using Middle Upper Arm Circumference (MUAC) measurements according to the new CMAM guidelines, by the end of 2014; and ii) streamlining monitoring and reporting.	Simplified protocols for MAM have already been prepared. SAM and its protocols are the mandate of UNICEF, so this activity can only be undertaken after discussion with them and their agreement. Reporting formats have been recently revised for NIS under the CMAM Technical Working Group (TWG) in consultation with all partners.	Subject to UNICEF/partner agreement, support a TWG under Nutrition Cluster/WG to work on simplified SAM protocols for LHWs and related monitoring tools.		Mar-Dec	Y
Successful treatment of MAM must be accompanied by non-food interventions to address the determinants of acute malnutrition and stunting. Specifically, WFP with the Ministry of Health Services Regulation and Coordination (MHSRC), UNICEF and the CMAM Working Group should develop: i) a standard practical prevention package aimed at creating sustainable behavioural change in feeding and care practices through mother groups led by	The need for an enhanced community outreach/IYCF component has been identified in the national-level CMAM partners review. Expanding this activity would require additional ODOC which would have future implications on funding. This work could be possible through partnership linkages and by reducing the scope of work (geographical locations/sites).	Strengthening of partnerships to further enhance IYCF component.		Mar-Dec	Y

Evaluation Recommendations	Management Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
LHWs; and ii) a set of agreed, standard indicators for monitoring impact. ¹					
<p>2. Recommendation 2: Country Office leadership should continue to advocate for longer term funding to resolve the FLA issue, and for the use of cash transfers where appropriate. Cash transfers have a great potential in Pakistan due to the well-functioning markets, food availability and strong banking systems in most parts of the country. If funding can be found, there is potential to expand the use of cash modalities to increase programmatic impact such as the increased food security of IDPs or an increased dietary diversity and food consumption score among households of acutely malnourished children. It is also appropriate to continue to explore linkages with the government social protection systems.</p>	<p>Accepted</p> <p>Regarding the short duration of FLAs, it is unfortunately a global issue, which the CO agrees, would be helpful to resolve, as FLAs are only signed for a duration for which resources have been confirmed in order not to over-commit.</p> <p>The CO has made considerable progress, and with considerable effort, in establishing systems for efficient and effective cash delivery/transfers under the livelihood/DRR programme, most recently for the IDPs from North Waziristan. However, the CO is facing shortfalls in its current cash requirements for livelihood/DRR programming. The CO is making concerted efforts to mobilize resources bilaterally; but the potential for expanding cash modalities is being fully capitalized and will continue to be pursued where</p>	WFP VAM unit to undertake cash feasibility study in FATA which will help in formulating strategy for such interventions under the next programme	VAM/Livelihood	April – Sep 2015	Y

¹See WHO 2007 publication, “Indicators for assessing infant and young child feeding practices.” http://whqlibdoc.who.int/publications/2008/9789241596664_eng.pdf

Evaluation Recommendations	Management Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
	<p>able.</p> <p>A very recent example of the expanded use of the cash modality is the increase of cash support to the internally displaced persons (IDPs) from North Waziristan who are being provided cash assistance in the areas of displacement. In the case of their return to their areas of origin, the CO will conduct an assessment on the feasibility of cash assistance interventions inside FATA, where the situation, as per VAM's last assessment, was not conducive for cash/voucher programmes.</p> <p>Similarly, as per the original approved plan US\$ 10 million were planned for cash support to IDPs. However, CO did not receive these funds and had to switch back to food distribution instead of cash.</p> <p>With regards to linkages with government social protection interventions, CO has already initiated exploring such linkages, not only regarding cash assistance but also with respect to prevention and treatment of undernutrition as well as data analysis within VAM. In 2014 WFP deployed a consultant to study the government's social safety net programmes and explore possibilities for linkages particularly with the Benazir Income Support Programme (BISP). The consultant gave valuable recommendations in this regard which</p>	<p>in Pakistan.</p> <p>WFP VAM and Livelihoods Units to explore further possibilities of collaboration with government's social safety-net programme</p>	VAM/Livelihoods	April – Sept.	N

Evaluation Recommendations	Management Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
	would be used in the formulation of the new programme.	in light of consultant's recommendations.			
Recommendation 3: At the earliest opportunity, the Country Office, supported by a full time Gender and Protection advisor, should consider setting up a Gender and Protection Steering and Implementation Committee (GPSIC) to ensure greater resource allocation (human and financial) for gender and protection matters. A GPSIC could support programme staff to systematically integrate gender equality and protection essentials ² in each area of work and demonstrate leadership on this matter. Cooperating partners along with Third Party Monitors (TPMs) should be assessed for their gender capacity and sensitivity prior to the award of any contracts to ensure more gender sensitive implementation practices including gender balanced monitoring teams.	<p>Accepted</p> <p>GPSIC is a good idea in terms of G&P mainstreaming work in WFP operations. The CO will establish a working group at CO level with representation from WFP's provincial offices and different units for ensuring integration of gender & protection into all WFP's units/operations. To this end, TORs will be developed, and selected members will be trained who will provide technical advice as per WFP's mandate.</p> <p>Similarly, WFP (HQ) is in the process of preparing a new Gender Policy (2015-2020). The CO will integrate its recommendations into different aspects of its operation, for which a work plan will be also developed.</p>	<p>Establishment of Gender and Protection Working Group and development of TORs.</p> <p>Integration of new gender policy into different areas of WFP's operations.</p>	ALL UNITS, G&P advisor will take the lead in terms of trainings, provision of required support, technical advice/ develop guidelines, etc.	<p>April – June (for establishment of working group and its TORs).</p> <p>Time frame for implementation of new gender policy 2015-2020 will be decided once approved policy is received from</p>	<p>N</p> <p>N</p>

² This involves assessing and addressing beneficiary groups diverse risks and constraints including their dignity, security and safety in various program settings such as in IDP camps, schools, distribution sites etc.

Evaluation Recommendations	Management Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
	<p>This proposed gender and protection working group will also help with gender marker indicators for formulating and implementing WFP's next programme.</p> <p>WFP Pakistan will concentrate on mainstreaming gender & protection in all related activities</p>	Capacity building of WFP staff, monitors and partners by a gender and protection advisor	Gender & protection focused training	HQ.	
Recommendation 4: Prior to the next PRRO, the Country Office should strengthen its DRR/DRM capacity in order to provide more dedicated technical and operational support to the government at both a national and provincial level. It should also examine ways to increase and diversify Community Based Disaster Risk Reduction (CBDRR) activities in a sustainable manner to reduce the vulnerability of targeted communities and improve overall programmatic impact. Increased capacity could come in the form of dedicated staff, a stand-alone office and the use of external, technical partnerships.	Accepted The Programme Officer (DRM) position in the CO is vacant but planned to be filled soon. Provincial level capacities would also be augmented by creating programme officer (DRR) positions. This would help reinforce the DRM unit with the required level of capacity. In addition to this, CO will continue providing institutional technical support to the government (NDMA/PDMAs) to strengthen and enhance important DRM capacities. Starting from last the quarter of 2014, CO initiated CBDRM and School Safety activities in five districts. CO will assess the results of these interventions and based on lessons learnt, will integrate such interventions into its broader DRR programming, supported through its cash-for-	Programme Officer to be taken on board.	Human Resource	March – June	Y
		Study of ongoing CBDRM intervention to assess their integration with DRR	DRR/Livelihood/DRM/M&	June-September	N

Evaluation Recommendations	Management Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
	<p>work modality.</p> <p>Since last year, WFP has also been working closely with the National Disaster Management Authority (NDMA) through annual joint work plan signed by the heads of both the agencies for effective collaboration and provision of institutional support. The joint work plan contributes to NDMA's efforts to implement the NDMP (National Disaster Management Plan).</p>	component	E		
<p>Recommendation 5: In collaboration with Provincial Programme Management Units (PMUs), the Department of Health (DoH) and UNICEF, and with external technical assistance, the Country Office should pilot test innovative, cost-effective and simplified approaches to the product based management of acute malnutrition in two districts of Punjab and Balochistan, where the PMU has shown considerable interest in delivery through the LHWs. This should be a simple operational effectiveness study to explore the use of one product for the treatment of SAM and MAM and should test i) effectiveness through monitoring of standard outcome indicators and ii) the feasibility of delivering the product through the LHWs; and iii) appropriate ration levels and duration. This should last six-nine months and the findings should be documented and disseminated.</p>	<p>Partially Accepted</p> <p>While CO will continue to work on food based approaches, testing other approaches is subject to agreement with relevant partners (GoP and UNICEF) as well as other interested partners like the WB.</p> <p>The study for using one product has already been proposed in agreement with the government. Currently WFP is preparing a ToR which will be discussed with UNICEF and submitted to the WB to be included as part of PC1 operational research.</p>	Complete and submit ToRs for exploring use of same SNF for treatment of MAM and SAM.	Nutrition	April	N

Evaluation Recommendations	Management Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
Recommendation 6: In collaboration with the World Bank and UNICEF, WFP should provide institutional, technical and budgetary support to the DoH-PMU/nutrition through an institutional block grant including human resource support to ensure: i) government leadership in developing implementation plans for the Planning Commission – Proforma 1 (PC-1) (2015 roll out) and setting strategic direction; ii) effective coordination, geographical targeting and the harmonization of activities; iii) an increase in the number of LHWs under the purview of the PMU from 2015 onwards to expand current coverage; and iv) long term contractual support to specific public/ private partnerships in uncovered LHW areas. Government ownership and a clear strategic direction will enable the DoH to attract funding in line with its strategic priorities.	Partially Accepted WFP has already begun providing technical support to government coordination structures such as the SUN Secretariat and National Fortification Alliance. Also, capacity development of LHW related activities has been included in an integrated 3 year UN programme proposal of US\$ 10.5 million prepared by [OP-II] SPA-6 members under WFP's leadership (funds in process of being raised).	UN joint fundraising strategy and collective approach to donors.	Nutrition	Jan-Dec 2015	Y
Recommendation 7: In collaboration with the FATA Secretariat, UNICEF the World Bank and other local partners, the CO should address current gaps in coverage, gender parity and programme complementarity in FFE by: i) expanding the FFE intervention to uncovered areas meeting the criteria for access ii) replacing food rations for focal teachers with a cash payment; iii) repairing non-functioning schools and providing key inputs to create a girl friendly environment	Partially Accepted i) In view of the expected return of IDPs to Khyber and North Waziristan Agencies this year, WFP is planning to cover the functional and accessible schools in coordination with government authorities and other stakeholders; however, it is subject to the availability of additional funds and access. ii) Regarding cash payment to the focal teachers	Tentative number of schools and beneficiaries is finalized in consultation with FATA secretariat. The food and non-food items requirement	Education	Subject to return to NWA and Bara, school feeding intervention will be initiated in April	Y

Evaluation Recommendations	Management Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
<p>including boundary walls, toilets and the provision of water through links to recovery programming such as CFW; iv) improving the on-site High Energy Biscuit (HEB) snack with the addition of milk or fortified juice, supported by community contributions; and v) promote 'Nourishing Bodies Nourishing Minds' (NBNM) in practice by supporting synergies between nutrition and education . This should include tangible inputs including the delivery of iron/folate or Micro Nutrient Powder (MNP) to adolescent girls at school and in the community, and de-worming campaigns at primary and senior schools.</p> <p>The distribution of food commodities in FFE must be complemented by other interventions to address the economic and cultural constraints that affect dropout rates and the retention of girls in school in class 6 and above. This should include the pilot testing of conditional cash transfers to target families for transport and other costs of attending school in one Agency in line with the <i>Waseela-e-Taleem</i>/Benazir Income Support Programme (BISP) model and establishing school, parent and community linkages through existing mechanisms such as the female Jirga.³</p>	<p>of School Feeding programme, WFP would advocate with the government to allocate funds in PC1 to incentivize the focal teachers for the additional amount of work under the School Feeding programme supported by leveraging WFP's intervention.</p> <p>iii) The criteria for WFP FFE intervention is the selection of schools which are accessible and functional and have the minimum required infrastructure to implement the programme; while the provision of missing facilities is the mandate of the government and other agencies like UNICEF, which could be ensured through effective lobbying and partnership; WFP has been continuously making efforts to this end and lately the government has come up with some funds to provide missing facilities in WFP assisted schools. As to the other UN agencies, they have very limited coverage in FATA; repair and reconstruction of government schools is governed by set procedures and standards which requires adequate material supply and skilled labour cost, while the scope of CFW/FFW activities is limited with little provision for material or skilled labour cost; so there is minimal chances of integration with FFE. However, efforts would be made to seek government contributions through effective linkages with the FATA Development Plan.</p>	<p>plan is also been prepared.</p> <p>FATA secretariat is planning a few schemes for provision of the missing facilities in schools in FATA, once the schemes are approved an integration plan will be prepared with WFP-FATA secretariat; subject to availability of funds for FFE-CFW integration.</p> <p>Coordination with other stakeholders</p> <p>Task force will be constituted at CO and PO level to synergize education and nutrition.</p>		<p>Regular follow-up will be maintained for ensuring inclusion of WFP assisted schools for provision of missing facilities.</p> <p>April – June</p>	<p>N</p> <p>N</p>

³ A co- responsibility cash transfer is provided through BISP to allow for costs of school and transport. This is a four-year programme supported by DfID and World Bank in four provinces.

Evaluation Recommendations	Management Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
	<p>iv) Due to the complex security situation in FATA, logistically it would be quite difficult to maintain effective supply chains for the provision of food commodities which are highly perishable; particularly, to manage handling and storage of milk/juice due to associated high losses (around 30%). Product quality and food safety are a risk to beneficiaries in case of product deterioration or spoiling. There is also a risk of reselling in the market and the added corruption element. Additionally, HEBs are fortified products therefore no other fortified snack should be incorporated. However, WFP remains committed to providing technical guidance to the government for the design and implementation of home-grown school feeding programmes wherever such a commitment, and interest, is shown by the government.</p> <p>v) As part of NBNM, coordination with UNICEF, UNESCO, FATA Secretariat and WHO is ongoing. Deworming is planned in 2015 in collaboration with WHO and FATA Secretariat.</p> <p>For pilot testing of conditional cash transfers to the families of school children, WFP will explore possibilities of greater linkages with the government's Benazir Income Support Programme under the WFP's next programme in Pakistan.</p>	Coordination with WHO and FATA's health department is in progress and deworming campaign will be launched		April - September	Y

Evaluation Recommendations	Management Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
Recommendation 8: In selecting areas for intervention for the next PRRO, the CO should ensure programme synergies in practice to consolidate outcomes and improve sustainability. This should include direct and tangible links between FFE, nutrition, early recovery, Livelihood (CFW) and social protection programmes. Convergence of programming should also include links between acute malnutrition and stunting through innovative food based and non-food approaches. It will also require innovation in targeting mechanisms to achieve impact at scale. Delivering a food supplement for PLW and children 6-24 months through existing social protection schemes such as BISP has the advantage of pre-selecting vulnerable groups in urban and rural areas and can be scaled up in a phased approach. In food insecure areas, particularly those with high chronic and acute malnutrition rates, WFP may consider providing regular seasonal work opportunities during hunger gaps and/or periods of limited work. The diversification and expansion of livelihood activities into income generating activities should also be	Accepted Ongoing work on targeting for PRRO 2016-18 has considered a prioritization of geographic clusters of districts based on levels of food insecurity, malnutrition and poverty using a number of data sets such as IPC phases, poverty data from BISP and the findings from the food security analysis. This is expected to ensure programme synergies for a tangible outcome in the proposed areas; this subject has also been part of discussions in each of the provincial government and stakeholder consultations. Under the current PRRO, efforts are being made to build in-house synergies within the different programme components. A recent example is in Sindh where there is almost 100 percent geographic integration between the programme components of CMAM and livelihood/DRR wherever both activities are implemented. The CO will also advocate for registration of malnourished children and PLWs in households supported by WFP's livelihood/DRR interventions.	CO has already started discussing these issues.	Management/VAM	Feb – May	N
		The proposed recommendation of different consultation meetings for the formulation of new PRRO has been taken into account and completed. Further integration to register malnourished children and PLWs for assistance under Livelihoods/DRR to be carried out.	Nutrition/Livelihoods	March - December	N

Evaluation Recommendations	Management Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
considered in order to increase women's participation.					