

OPERATION EVALUATION

Ghana, Country Programme, 200247:

An evaluation of WFP's Operation (2012-2016)

Management Response

[June, 2015] – MR to the Report OE/2014/015

Management response cleared by:

Country Director: Ms. Mutinta Chimuka, 3 June 2015

Detailed responses to evaluation recommendations

Evaluation Recommendations	Management Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
Recommendation 1: Reduce programme geographical coverage through reassessing WFP capacity to implement activities in 7 regions and 54 districts.	Partially accepted Component1 (SM) Work with current model and within the current geographical coverage and work towards handing over to government by the end of 2016. Component1 (THR) Continue with the current 12 targeted districts since the selection criteria used is still relevant. (EMIS data, schools at least 5km from the district capital, Gender Parity Index (GPI)) Component2 The Eastern Region will remain a targeted region as it is the region with the highest HIV prevalence in Ghana, though not one of the most food insecure. An appraisal mission from WFP Headquarters and the Regional Bureau recommended that the Eastern Region remains a target. Component 3 The Government of Ghana's SADA strategy	General Action <ul style="list-style-type: none"> WFP will conduct a new CFSVA in 2016 to analyze the current food security and vulnerability situation and the findings will serve as a basis for geographical targeting for all components of the next Country Programme. WFP will also conduct a SMART survey to further inform nutrition targeting under Component2 in particular. Component1 (School meals) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Conduct a SABER 2015 to assess the capacity of GoG/GSFP Focus on technical/capacity support to the government of Ghana in the next Country Programme. Component1 (THR) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Work with GES to identify districts that have attained Gender Parity and wean them off the programme in the next Country Programme. For the next Country programme, the 	VAM Nutrition and M&E M&E and Prog. Programme Programme and M&E Programme	2016 Q4 2015 Q4 2015 To begin in Q1 2017 Q3 2016 Q3 2016	Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes Yes

Evaluation Recommendations	Management Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
	covers the whole of the Northern Savannah Ecological Zone which includes the northern parts of the Brong Ahafo and the Volta Regions. The Country Office would like to keep the five regions in order to be aligned to the Government's SADA strategy.	<p>targeting criteria will be reviewed to include school level EMIS data, school level GPI and most food insecure districts- (by April 2016)</p> <p>Component 3</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Country office will reduce the number of targeted districts per region based on the findings of the next CFSVA and the integrated approach in the next Country Programme. The Country Office will ensure geographical convergence and integration between Asset Creation and P4P, School Feeding and Nutrition as well as other livelihoods activities supported by partners and focus on community assets and activities that build resilience, enhance value chain as well as local production of smallholder farmers. 	<p>Sub Office, Programme</p> <p>Programme</p>	<p>Q1 2017</p> <p>Q4 2016</p>	<p>Yes</p> <p>Yes</p>

Evaluation Recommendations	Management Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
Recommendation 2: Continue to strengthen programme monitoring and evaluation through capacity building, adding staff and stronger feedback loops between WFP Program and M&E units	Accepted	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Country Office will take necessary steps to enhance the capacity of WFP M&E and counterpart staff through in-country training as well as project-specific M&E training opportunities (e.g. FFA impact assessment as per corporate manual) available at the Regional Bureau or elsewhere. 	M&E, Sub Office	Ongoing	Yes
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The CO is currently recruiting 8 National Service Personnel to strengthen WFP monitoring and reporting. Six of them will be assigned to Districts and will support district level reporting 	M&E and Programme	Ongoing	No
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Country Office is currently revising the monitoring forms and checklists for Component 2 to align with changes in the updated log frame. 	M&E and Programme	Ongoing	No
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Country Office accepts the recommendation regarding orientation and mentoring of Field Monitors and will ensure that this is done especially for newly recruited Field Monitors. 	M&E and Programme	Ongoing	No
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Country Office will take steps to institute a joint monitoring with the government counterparts for Component 3 and continue to strengthen the annual joint monitoring for Component 2. 	Programme and M&E	Q3 2015	Yes
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Country Office is currently implementing a monitoring strategy that tracks programme 			

Evaluation Recommendations	Management Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
		changes through targeted (component-focused) quarterly monitoring. Such monitoring reports are shared with the relevant WFP programme staff who in turn engage with the cooperating partners to ensure that programming and operational issues are addressed in a timely manner.	Programme and M&E	Ongoing	No
Recommendation 3: Continue to advocate for the resolution of the government's funding constraints related to food clearance and transport through a reengagement process with the	Partially accepted Due to the current economic and financial conditions, the Government of Ghana is facing challenges with financing the clearing of imported food as well as transportation, storage and distribution. This has been a long standing issue and is not likely to be resolved in the near future according to several sources	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Country Office is preparing a Budget Revision (BR) to seek approval for the inclusion of LTSH in order for WFP to cover the costs until the end of the current CP. Management will take steps to revise the MoU between WFP and MOH/GHS to strengthen accountability, auditing, and clarify roles and responsibilities of the parties. In order to increase local procurement for Component 1, vegetable oil is being procured locally while steps are being taken to increase purchases of maize from smallholder farmers. For Component 2 a technical audit of in- 	CD, DCD, Programme CD, DCD Programme DCD, Programme and Procurement CD, DCD	Ongoing Q3 2015 Ongoing	Yes No No

Evaluation Recommendations	Management	Management - Action to be taken			
	Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
MoH and MoE that ensures they fulfil their responsibilities to timely transport, properly store and distribute food, and appropriately account for and track food/ cash/ vouchers.		country food processors has been undertaken to assess their capacities and the report suggests that local procurement is possible from 2017, for the special nutritious foods. To this end, the Country Office has submitted a funding proposal for the upgrade of the production lines of selected industrial processors to be able to produce Supercereals at WFP standards. If successful, Supercereals will be procured locally instead of imported, thus easing the financial burden on the Govt.	Programme	Q1 2017	Yes
Recommendation 4: WFP should strive to continue to capacitate government to provide a model of excellence for school feeding; provide more training to School Management Committees/ School Implementation	Accepted	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The Country Office will work through the partners, the MoE/GES, the GSFP and the DAs to train the District Implementation Committees (DICs), School Management Committees (SMCs) and School Implementation Committees (SICs) in the current Country Programmed and continue in the next Country Programmed as part of the technical/capacity support to the government. • As part of the capacity building to MoE/GES and GSFP for the implementation of a national school feeding programme, a SABER process will be undertaken • In addition, WFP Ghana will support 	Programme Programme	Q2 2015 and beyond Ongoing	No No

Evaluation Recommendations	Management Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
Committees in order to ensure quality in SMs; and encourage community ownership including stronger social accountability mechanisms		MoE/GES and GSFP in translating the school feeding policy into law by funding a legal consultant to draft the law, with the support from the Centre of Excellence of Brazil	Programme	Q2 2016	No
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Country Office will also facilitate effective linkages between the caterers and local farmers, especially the P4P smallholder farmers and women's FF groups in Northern Region and explore the possible use of vouchers in a limited number of schools, to serve as "model" of effective linkage. The Country Office will hold a workshop with stakeholders in 2016 to review and rethink the School Meals model in a manner that empowers the SMCs/SICs and the head teachers and to strengthen community ownership as part of preparation for the technical support in the next Country Programmed. The Sub-office will ensure timely sharing of all information relating to payments to caterers with stakeholders by copying such information/correspondences to the GSFP secretariat, GES, SMCs and the school heads. 	Programme	Q2 2015	No

Evaluation Recommendations	Management Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
Recommendation 5: Consider using a voucher system for caterers, restricting their purchase to pre-assessed food vendors and limiting their profit level on school feeding to 20% of their total payment	Partially accepted There have been recommendations based on a study conducted by Partnership for Child Development (PCD) to government to increase the feeding cost per child per day, which currently is fifty pesewas. It is difficult and costly to monitor and limit the profits of caterers. The rate is flat across the country throughout year while the food and other cost differ from a place to another, from a harvest season to a lean season - if limiting the profits level, the rate should also flexibly changed which increases tremendous cost. Rather, it is more important to ensure the minimum quantity and quality standards of meals by strengthening supervision capacity of SMCs/SICs including the communities. WFP ready to pilot the voucher system in only a subset of schools located in communities where we are sure we will have the necessary support on the supply side for the farmers (i.e., where we have a partner like SNV supporting farmers which can ensure the supply on the farmers side, while	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A study on cost efficiency will be undertaken, focusing more on the quality and quantity of food served by the caterers, while ensuring standardization through the use of handy measures and a menu planner software. 	VAM and M&E with Programme	Q4 2015	Yes
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A market study will also be conducted to assess the capacity of local food traders and farmers to ascertain the feasibility of using vouchers. 	VAM and M&E	Q4 2015	Yes
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A voucher system will be piloted in only a subset of schools located in communities where supply-side partners will provide necessary support on for the farmers (e.g. SNV) to ensure the supply to caterers, while WFP will provide vouchers to the caterers. 	Programme	Q3 2015	Yes
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Training workshop on PCD menu planner and handy measures will be conducted for school caterers, SMCs/SICs. 	Programme	Q2 2015	No

Evaluation Recommendations	Management Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
	WFP gives vouchers to the caterers).				
Recommendation 6: Mass campaign on encouraging parents to feed their children breakfast before attending school, involving GOG/ MOE/ GES and UNICEF; in addition, consider changing the timing of the school meals to accommodate a longer first break at 10:00 am	Partially Accepted It is costly to monitor and control the school meal time and there is a concern that some of the pupils might leave school after feeding.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Country Office will conduct a study to analyse the situation and to inform the choice of specific actions needed to address the problem of parents not providing breakfast for their children before school. As part of the technical support to government in the next Country Programme, the Country Office will fund a mass campaign on the importance of eating breakfast at home jointly with other partners and stakeholders per the findings of the above study. 	Communication, VAM and M&E Programme	Q4 2015 Q2 2016	Yes Yes
Recommendation 7: Focus MAM treatment in areas with high food insecurity	Accepted	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Country Office will work with REACH, UNICEF and other partners to focus on areas with high food insecurity and reduce the number of beneficiaries as per the recommendation of the appraisal mission. 	DCD, Sub Office, Programme	Q 3 2015	No

Evaluation Recommendations	Management Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
where there are elevated levels of acute malnutrition and reduce beneficiary targets Redesign MAM treatment for P/L women and children and revisit support for commercial production of CSB. Consider redesigning the HIV activity to target PMTCT program participants and develop a mentoring/supervisory model with GHS and UNICEF to ensure quality implementation for MAM/HIV activities.		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> To conduct SMART survey to identify areas with high levels of malnutrition. 	Programme	Q2 2016	Yes
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Based on the findings of the technical audit of in-country food processors, the Country Office has submitted a proposal to a donor which, if accepted, will allow WFP Ghana to undertake local purchase of specialized nutritious foods including Super Cereal. 	Programme and procurement	Ongoing	Yes
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Country Office is currently designing a Behaviour Change Communication approach, based on the review of the available studies and information on the determinants of acute malnutrition, which will be implemented as part of efforts to prevent further occurrence of MAM. 	Programme	Q3 2015	No
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Country Office will consider redesigning the PLHIV component activity to target PMTCT in the Northern regions and continue nutrition support to PLHIV on ART and their households in Eastern region 	DCD, Programme	Q4 2016	No
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Country Office will adopt a phased approach to the shift to PMTCT 	Programme	Q4 2017	No
Recommendation 8: Strengthen and expand the pilot nutrition activity	Accepted	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Country Office will focus more on preventing stunting among children while MAM treatment will be targeted mostly at pregnant and lactating women, as recommended by the technical re-appraisal 	DCD, Programme	Q1 2017	No

Evaluation Recommendations	Management Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
to address stunting and micronutrient deficiency in the follow-on CP and consider revitalizing existing and economically viable Women's FF groups, implement activities more collaboratively and advocate for the continuation of REACH.		of WFP nutrition interventions following the mid-term evaluation. This will be in line with the SUN Movement focusing on the first 1000 days of the child and the REACH Initiative.	Programme, Procurement	Q1 2016	No
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> In order to prevent stunting at a wider scale, WFP is considering using Nutributter during the pilot stage of the Japan funded New Nutrition Project, while exploring locally available nutritious foods and the upgrade of the local capacities to produce Supercereals to WFP standards, which will also be used to scale up prevention. This is as a result of government's reluctance in the use of MNP. Women Food Fortification groups will be supported through the new funding proposal submitted to a donor (yet to be approved), alongside the support to industrial processors for the commercial production of Supercereals 	Programme	Q2 2016	No
Recommendation 9: Diversify the asset creation portfolio and enhance the	Accepted	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Conduct capacity assessment of potential partners including NGOs and identify those with adequate technical and financial capacity. Diversify type of assets to include 	Programme	Q3 2015	Yes
			Programme	Q3 2015	Yes

Evaluation Recommendations	Management Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
linkages with agricultural production with a focus on low-cost, replicable methods for regenerating degraded lands and increasing productivity under marginal conditions		<p>conservation agricultural activities such as compost making, tree planting and bonding.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Facilitate learning visit by cooperating partners and selected farmers to similar projects in Burkina Faso on low-cost methods for regenerating degraded lands and increasing productivity under marginal conditions 	Programme	Q4 2015	Yes
Recommendation 10: Enhance integration of P4P into CP and particularly C3 through ensuring first a tangible market linkage strategy for P4P; and further adapting the pilot project to the Northern regions conditions and production systems, which means a specific attention to aggregation systems	Accepted	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The linkages between School Meals caterers and smallholder farmers through dry season gardening will be promoted. Asset Creation activities will also prioritize those activities that enhance the production of smallholder farmers. 	Programme Programme	Q4 2015 Q3 2015	No No

Evaluation Recommendations	Management Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
coupled with the promotion of low-input, labour-intensive, agro-ecological farming methods including the expansion and intensification of rice production systems					