

## OPERATION EVALUATION

[Ethiopia PRRO 2002700 - Food Assistance for  
Eritrean, South Sudanese, Sudanese and Somali Refugees  
(2015-2018): A mid-term evaluation of WFP's current  
operation and transition period (2014-2016)]

### **Management Response**

[June, 2016]



**World Food Programme**

Management response cleared by:

Country Director: Samir Wanmali, acting CD (senior DCD).

## Detailed responses to evaluation recommendations

Evaluation Recommendations	Management  <b>Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted</b> and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
<b>Recommendation 1:</b>  <b>Reintroduce blanket supplementary feeding to Dolo Ado for children 24-59 months, until Super Cereal is reinstated as part of the general food ration.</b>	<b>Accepted</b>  Comment: The BSFP has been re-introduced from May 2016. In June 2016, thanks to improved funding levels the CSB+ has also been re-introduced in the general basket.	Extend the BSF in Dollo to children 24-59 months while continuing to advocate for funds to maintain a full basket including CSB+	Programme refugee team	By June 2016	Y
<b>Recommendation 2:</b> <b>Strengthen the models and approaches for sharing key infant and young child feeding messages at household and camp levels alongside health and hygiene promotion, while improving the enabling environment to increase uptake by</b>	<b>Partially accepted:</b>  Although WFP is already working with UNHCR, ARRA and partners to improve the quality of nutritional programmes with a focus on strengthening functioning models and behavioral change, the direct responsibility for implementation of YCIF programmes lies with UNHCR, ARRA and nutrition partners. Likewise, hygiene and health do not fall within the WFP mandate, nor does provision of cooking fuel. On these aspects WFP can	WFP will continue to advocate with partners to improve the quality of the nutritional programmes with a focus on strengthened models for IYCF and behavior change.	Programme refugee and nutrition unit	Continuous	N

Evaluation Recommendations	Management  Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
<b>mothers/families of improved practices.</b>	continue its advocacy but cannot be held responsible for direct implementation.				
<b>Recommendation 3:</b>  <b>Recommendation 3. Promote more proactive WFP field monitor engagement with Administration for Refugees and Returnees Affairs to ensure that warehousing and the food distribution system are operating effectively, efficiently, and for the refugees.</b>	<b>Accepted</b>  WFP will continue to provide guidance and support to the ARRA staff in the field, and advocacy will continue with ARRA at Addis level to ensure that food management standards are met. It is to be noted however that direct implementation lies with WFP's government partner.	WFP to do a review of missing warehouse equipment and provide missing items  WFP logistics to re-train the ARRA warehouse staff  WFP FAM and logistics sub office staff to perform regular visits to the ARRA warehouses  Logistics to cement warehouses and to provide pallets when required.  Process and outcome monitoring in improvement of distribution to be incorporated in monitoring tools  Logistics to improve communication with ARRA warehouse staff and with	Logistics unit  Logistics unit  Logistics and FAM  Logistics  Refugee section and FAM  Logistics	2016  Regular  Regular – monthly  By mid 2017 for all camps  2016  Regular	N

Evaluation Recommendations	<b>Management</b> <b>Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted</b> and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	<b>Management - Action to be taken</b>			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
		WFP sub offices on the arrival of the commodities to the camps.  Advocacy with ARRA at central level to meet WFP warehousing standards  Provide new signboards (white boards) to the camps  Increase the number of distribution points per camp through the biometrics project (up to 3 DP in the larger Gambella camps)	Programme Refugee section    Programme refugee and engineering	Regular  Regular 2017  By mid-2017	    Y
<b>Recommendation 4:</b>  <b>Recommendation 4. Scale up promising and innovative livelihood activities to reach all camps and by the end of the next PRRO in 2021.</b>	<b>Accepted</b>  WFP is already working with UNHCR and ARRA on establishing a livelihood strategy per region based on market demand and opportunities, geo-climatic conditions, refugees skills and overall appropriateness around each camp. The first study focusing on Afar and Tigray will be conducted in 2016. The other will follow in 2017 and 2018.	WFP together with UNHCR and ARRA to conduct a review of existing livelihood activities in Shire and Afar  Replicate the study in all other regions hosting refugee camps  Put in place a long-term strategy per region informed by above study  Identify partners and implement in all regions.	Programme refugee section	End 2016  By 2018  By 2019  By 2021	Y

Evaluation Recommendations	<b>Management</b> <b>Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted</b> and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	<b>Management - Action to be taken</b>			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
	The strategy will be guided by annual workplans starting from when the studies will be available.	Develop annual workplan for livelihood	Programme refugee	From 2017	
<b>Recommendation 5: Develop a comprehensive strategy in collaboration with UNHCR to minimise the use of firewood for cooking, with the objective of reducing firewood use for cooking by December 2017 and eventually eliminating firewood use in the Ethiopia refugee camps</b>	<b>Partially accepted</b>  Although the WFP CO agrees that such a strategy on cooking fuel is absolutely required in Ethiopia and needs to be treated as a priority by UNHCR, the mandate for the provision of cooking fuel lies with UNHCR and not with WFP.  WFP will continue to advocate for UNHCR to prioritize the provision of energy, to work with UNHCR identify alternative cooking energy, and will endeavor to provide commodities that require limited amounts of cooking fuel (i.e yellow split peas instead of red beans).  However it is to be noted that UNHCR has been facing severe funding constraints that have forced the agency to prioritize life savings activities such as health and water to the detriment of energy, and that such funding difficulties are expected to continue.	Advocacy for UNHCR to prioritize the provision of cooking fuel.	Programme and CO management	Continuous	Y
		WFP to take into account cooking time when providing food commodities	Programme and procurement	Continuous	

Evaluation Recommendations	<b>Management</b> <b>Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted</b> and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	<b>Management - Action to be taken</b>			
		<b>Action</b>	<b>Responsible CO unit</b>	<b>Timeframe</b>	<b>Further funding required (Y or N)</b>
<b>Recommendation 6:</b>  <b>Ensure greater participation and representation of women in camp leadership positions in proportion to their population in the camps, and expand the number of female WFP field staff.</b>	<b>Partially accepted</b>  The CO will continue to promote women's leadership role in refugee committees.  With regards to staffing however, it is extremely difficult to attract and retain female staff in remote field locations of Ethiopia. Although the gender ratio is good in Addis Ababa, there are generally very few female applicants to field positions in spite of the efforts made by the CO to encourage women to apply.  Giving specific incentives to women is challenging, as WFP abides by the UN rules and grids in terms of staff salaries and benefits and as no discrimination can be made against male staff. It is however possible, and a practice, to promote the recruitment of women at equal qualification.	WFP to discuss with refugee committees and promote the greater inclusion of women in refugee committees.  WFP to promote the recruitment of women, at equal qualification with men, especially in field offices.	SOs  HR	Continuous  Continuous	N
<b>Recommendation 7:</b> <b>Expand the cash transfer initiative as a principal strategy of the general food distribution component of the Refugee PRRO</b>	<b>Accepted</b>  The cash will be scaled up to all camps of Tigray and Benishangul Gumuz (minus Tsore) by 2016, while Afar (Berhale), Gambella and Jijiga (Kebribeyah) and Tsore are under consideration for 2016/2017. Market	Scale up of the cash to Tigray and Assossa by August –September 2016.  Market assessments in Gambella and Tsore in second half of 2016	Programme refugee  Refugee and VAM	2016  2016	Y

Evaluation Recommendations	<b>Management</b> <b>Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted</b> and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	<b>Management - Action to be taken</b>			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
	<p>assessments and beneficiary consultations have already been conducted in Tigray, Benishangul Gumuz and Jijiga in 2016</p> <p>Discussions are also ongoing with ARRA to replace the entire cereals basket by cash in Jijiga, but no agreement has been reached to date.</p> <p>No agreement has either been reached to date on Dollo Ado although discussions continue</p> <p>The option to distribute milling voucher is currently under consideration and discussion with ARRA and UNHCR.</p> <p>WFP will however need to receive more flexible cash donations from its donors.</p>	<p>Beneficiary consultations in Gambella and Tsore</p> <p>Scale up to Gambella, Afar and Kebribeyah and Tsore by 2017 pending funding availability.</p> <p>Pursue discussion on Dollo and Jijiga cash expansion with ARRA.</p> <p>Explore the introduction of milling voucher or cash for milling in cash camps</p>	Programme refugee	<p>2016</p> <p>2016-2017</p> <p>Continuous from 2016</p> <p>By 2017</p>	
<b>Recommendation 8: The concerted and coordinated effort of WFP in collaboration with all actors in the camps experiencing high global acute malnutrition rates (Gambella, Dolo Ado and Afar camps) should be strengthened to develop a</b>	<p><b>Accepted</b></p> <p>As the drivers of high GAM rates are multisector and the systematic provision of the full food basket, but also of cooking fuel and other NFIs is required, additional donor funding will be needed to decrease GAM rates in the camps</p>	<p>Undertake a causal nutrition analysis in Dollo Ado together w UNHCR, ARRA and nutrition partners</p> <p>Establish a joint workplan for Dollo Ado workplan in order to implement the recommendations</p> <p>Undertake nutrition causal analysis in Afar with UNHCR and ARRA and</p>	Programme refugee and nutrition	<p>2016</p> <p>2016</p> <p>2017</p> <p>2017</p>	Y



Evaluation Recommendations	Management  Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
<b>comprehensive understanding of the drivers of under-nutrition in each camp and develop a multi-sector approach to address them.</b>		<p>establish a joint workplan to implement recommendations</p> <p>Undertake a nutrition causal analysis in Gambella if the GAM rates remain high in 2016 and 2017</p> <p>Gambella nutrition workplan and implementation</p>		<p>2017</p> <p>2018</p>	
<b>Recommendation 9: Increase provision of WFP nutrition expertise for the refugee programme—to provide strategic as well technical support.</b>	Accepted	<p>One nutritionist from the programme nutrition team in Addis Ababa to focus on the refugee operation in Addis.</p> <p>Train Sub Office staffs in order to have nutrition focal points in Dollo, Gambella and Afar</p>	<p>Programme Management and CO management</p> <p>Programme nutrition</p>	<p>2016</p> <p>By 2017</p>	N
<b>Recommendation 10: In the spirit of programme efficiency and effectiveness, WFP and UNHCR should increase formal collaboration on strategic planning,</b>	Accepted	<p>WFP to invite UNHCR during its annual workplanning meeting</p> <p>WFP to request UNHCR to be invited at the UNHCR annual workplan meetings</p>	<p>Programme refugee</p> <p>Programme refugee and CO management</p>	<p>Continuous</p> <p>Continuous</p>	N

Evaluation Recommendations	Management  Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Management - Action to be taken			
		Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
advocacy, and programme prioritisation.		Joint programme planning and design to be done jointly  Appeals and fundraising done jointly	Programme CO management	Continuous  Continuous	