EVALUATION D'OPERATION

Tchad Interventions prolongées de secours et de redressement (IPSR) 200713, Renforcer la résilience protéger les moyens d'existence et réduire la malnutrition parmi les réfugiés, les rapatriés et les autres personnes vulnérables : Une évaluation à mi-parcours d'opération du PAM (janvier 2015 – mars 2016) **Réponse de la direction**

[Aout, 2016]



World Food Programme

Réponse de la direction certifiée par:

Directeur Pays: Mary-Ellen McGroarty/18 August 2016

Detailed Responses to the recommendations of the evaluation

	Direction	Direction - Mesures à Prendre				
Evaluation Recommendations	Accept, partially accept or refuse	Measures to be taken	Unit Responsible	Time-frame	Supplementary finance neccessary (Y ou N)	
Recommendation 1:						
 Redesign the MAM treatment giving more emphasis to the prevention of malnutrition 1.1 Improve the current implementation of the treatment of moderate acute malnutrition [PCIMAM]¹ activity, by strengthening monitoring in the Supplementary Nutrition Units of the participating health centres [UNS]² in the Sahel area, or by adjusting the system for the provision of MAM treatment to the monitoring capacities. 	Accepted	The country office, with support from the regional bureau will review the current nutrition portfolio and develop an implementation plan striking the balance between treatment and prevention where appropriate given the malnutrition burden in Chad. The country office will continue to strengthen the capacity of District Health Authorities to supervise and monitor treatment activities. The country office will draw lessons from the UNICEF model and where feasible explore opportunities for collaboration to optimize treatment programmes	Programme Nutrition with support from the Regional Bureau	December 2016	Ο	
 1.2 Clarify the CO's medium term perspectives and strategies on MAM treatment support. Define, jointly with partners, objectives related to the: A / level of engagement at regional and local level of the government's 		In 2017, the country office will define its nutrition strategy for the period 2018 -2022 as part of the process to develop the Country Strategy Plan (CSP). The CSP will be underpinned by a comprehensive analysis and consultations to support country led and country owned solutions, and reinforce national ownership and capacity.		November 2017		

¹ Prise en charge intégrée de la malnutrition aigüe modérée (PCIMAM) = treatment of moderate acute malnutrition

² Unités de nutrition supplémentaire = Supplementary Nutrition Units within health centres

technical services in MAM treatment of the UNS in the Sahel region;	The country office is working with the European Union on multi-year funding to support nutrition governance structures at national/regional/local level through the REACH framework.	
 B / implementation of a community level MAM treatment pilot, outside of the health system (in one restricted location); learn from this experience to define the conditions for a potential scale up. C/ integration of the 	The country office with support from the regional bureau will design a community level treatment pilot. The pilot will incorporate lessons learned from other countries adjusted to the Chad context, specifically challenges in respect of capacity and thus the need to maintain links with the health system.	March 2017
(refugees/returnees) camp's health centres into the national system; plan	The integration of refugee health services into the national system is the mandate of UNHCR.	
to discontinue the support given to refugees / returnees with low GAM prevalence in the regions not targeted by the PCIMAM programme.	The country office in consultation with UNHCR will review ongoing nutrition support programmes in refugee camps, the review will take due account of protection issues, vulnerability characteristics and challenges related to maintaining regular appropriate levels of food assistance.	March 2017
1.3 Regarding the synergies between the inter-agency project on food fortification and the PRRO, give particular attention to i) the promotion of fortified flour(s) among PRRO beneficiaries, and ii) the use of local flour(s) in the seasonal supplementary feeding interventions.	The fortification project is designed to explore and develop a locally produced fortified flour for general consumption. A decision was made at the design stage not to link the final product with ongoing nutrition programmes, but rather focus on feasibility and sustainability broader than aid programmes. However, the country office will explore modes of education/ nutrition sensitive models within ongoing programmes to promote use of the final product.	
1.4 Invest in the coordination, at the decentralized level, of the prevention activities planned by the PAINA. ³	The country office will incorporate elements of the newly adopted national nutritional policy to mainstream/reinforce prevention activities into agreements with partners (FLAs). The country office will	December 2016

³ Plan d'action intersectoriel pour la nutrition et l'alimentation (PAINA) = Inter-sectoral food and nutrition action plan

1.5 At the operational level: i) ensure a detailed monitoring of MAM in the north-east refugee camps; ii) systematically integrate actions to promote health care and appropriate food practices among beneficiaries.		 request cooperating partners to integrate specific actions addressing root causes and contributing factors of malnutrition such as water and sanitation, access to health care, feeding of newborn and young child (ANJE) into project proposals. The country office will strengthen the monitoring of MAM in the refugee camps. 		December 2016	
Recommandation 2:					0
Adjust the level and the modalities of assistance to refugees / returnees based on their specific situations	Accepted	 In close collaboration with the regional bureau and headquarters (OSZP), and with a range of partners including Ministers and key UN agencies, WFP Chad will implement the Three-Pronged Approach (3PA) to strengthen its country strategy and strategic programming including the food security, nutrition and livelihood support assistance provided to refugees, IDPS and returnees. Developed by WFP in consultation with governments and partners, the 3PA is a robust and inclusive programming approach comprising of three processes at three levels; The Integrated Context Analysis (ICA), at the national level, which helps identify the most appropriate programmatic strategies in specific geographical areas, based on areas of convergence of historical trends of food insecurity, natural shocks and land degradation, The Seasonal Livelihood Programming (SLP), at the sub-national level which brings together communities, governments and partners to design 	Programme /RB/OS ZP	June 2017	

 2.1 Adjust the level of rations to the specific situations of the areas in which the refugee camps and the returnee sites are located. 2.2 Strengthen monitoring data collection and analysis: distinguish between camps with, and without, differentiated rations; consider the socio-professional status (beyond wealth). 	 multi-year, multi-sectorial operational plans using seasonal and gender lenses. The Community-Based Participatory Planning (CBPP), at the local level which is used to develop multi- sectorial plans tailored to local priorities. The country office has adjusted the level of rations to address the different levels of vulnerability in the different geographic zones. The country office will improve monitoring and data collection, PDM tools will incorporate specific questions to address the concerns raised by the evaluation team. 	December 2016
 2.3 Play an active role, in close partnerships with UNHCR and the Government, in the search for sustainable and durable solutions for refugees and returnees: a. Finalize the CNARR⁴ – UNHCR – WFP joint strategy, which should translate into a joint advocacy strategy for donors; b. Review the lessons learned (in terms of refugees and returnees' self-sufficiency), ensuring an active inclusion of government services; c. Strengthen WFP's operational strategy on refugees and returnees' self-sufficiency i) taking into account the specificities of each area (north-east; east and south); ii) identifying the role 	The country office will use the 3PA approach (above) to inform the food and nutrition strategy for the refugee camps. The approach will inform a joint strategy, complement and build on the recently completed UNHCR/WFP Joint Assessment Mission, include a socio- economic profiling of the different camps, food and nutrition needs, modalities and levels of assistance, explore livelihood opportunities, the potential role of FFA, the required partnerships and complementarities, progress, impact and incorporate lessons learned in respect of ongoing activities to build self-reliance. The country office with the support of the regional bureau and Headquarters will explore the feasibility of a corporate funding/insurance mechanism to ensure	December 2017

⁴ Commission nationale d'accueil et de réinsertion des réfugiés et des rapatriés (CNARR) = national commitee of reinsertion of the refugees and returnees

of FFA activities in this strategy ⁵ ; iii) contributing to the design of long-term development projects that include the host population; and iv) taking into account the refugees and returnees' socio-professional projects and the effective opportunities available to them.		appropriate levels of food assistance pending durable solutions.			
Recommandation 3:Follow more closely the seasonal calendar for targeted food assistance (AAC) ⁶ and promote a coordinated response from all actors3.1 Define a calendar with the step-by-step operational planning and implementation phases of the seasonal AAC, so as to intervene in the right period of the hunger season 3.2 Support a coordinated response: discuss	Partially accepted (as many of the recommended actions were already implemented for 2016 lean season	The greater part of the recommendations put forward by the evaluation team were addressed in early 2016. The seasonal assistance programme was designed in close collaboration with all partners including the Government and donors within the food security cluster framework. Areas of intervention were prioritized on the basis of food security and nutrition indicators and assistance modalities were defined and harmonized. Interventions across the targeted regions started in sync with the lean season. The country office will build on the progress made in 2016	Programme/SOs	September 2016 March 2017	Ν
with other actors (government, food security cluster, ECHO and NGO) in view to: i) adopt common standards in the annual response plans (for categories of targeted beneficiaries, length and amount of transfer/assistance, number of people assisted in a household, assistance modalities); ii) have a better geographical distribution of the assistance, and iii) prepare standardized reports.	response)	by convening a lessons learned exercise at end of the lean season. In addition, the country office will use the SLP (response recommendation 2), working with Government, donors and partners to begin to define the 2017 response, and to support the government to assume a more central and effective coordination and leadership role			

⁵ In addition to the development actions at medium and long term done by UNHCR, FFA activities could focus on: rehabilitation of natural resources, small scale agricultural production and food diversification, risk reduction, etc ...

⁶ Assistance alimentaire ciblée (AAC) = targeted food assistance

Recommandation 4: Implement the new resilience-focused asset creation approach, in a limited number of areas	Accepted				0
 4.1 Continue the 2015 ongoing projects to finalise the construction of the already planned assets. 4.2 Finalize and implement the FFA strategy⁷, focusing on the following key elements: use of participatory approaches during the planning of activities⁸; quality of the assets created / rehabilitated; complementarity with other actors' interventions; selection of an appropriate intervention scale; identification of the most adequate areas to implement the approach; awareness of and taking into account women's specific needs and situation; WFP's sustained engagement in the medium-term (3 years); strengthening the capacities of the governmental technical services. 		The country office will review the portfolio of the ongoing projects and develop a road-map to complete pending projects where feasible. To support this, the country office will undertake and communicate a prioritization exercise to partners so as to direct limited resources to the most appropriate areas, optimize the possibility for impact and manage expectations. As per recommendation 2 above the country office will implement the 3PA to shape the resilience portfolio, the 3PA will address the areas highlighted by the evaluation team In 2016, with the support of headquarters and the regional bureau the country office has adopted the participatory approach for FFA activities in the Lake Chad region. Consultative sessions have engaged communities, partners and government, to identify areas of intervention, types of activities and calendars for implementation. Special consideration is given to the	Programme/RB/OS NZ	December 2016 June 2017	

⁷ Based on the guidance provided in the PGM guide: « Building Resilience through asset creation", WFP, Novembre 2013

⁸ Using the three level approach: Integrated Context Analysis (AIC - Analyse intégrée de contexte), Seasonal Livelihood Programming (PSME - Programmation saisonnière basée sur les moyens d'existence) and Community-based Participatory Planning (PCP - plans communautaires participatifs).

4.3 Build on the strengths and weaknesses of the new approach, by i) widening the tracked impact indicators (to measure the progress achieved on community and households' resilience); ii) undertaking socio- economic independent studies; and iii) organizing regular learning workshops with the CO, sub-offices and the partners involved.		needs of women, and activities include technical support to government structures at local and regional level. The country office will engage with the regional bureau for regular support over the course of 2017 to continuously improve the approach to FFA. The country office will specifically address this recommendation when designing and implementing the CSP.			
Recommandation 5:					
 Strengthen the capacities of WFP and its partners to better integrate gender and protection issues 5.1 Establish partnerships with NGOs specialized in gender issues to cover (in the short term) the lack of internal capacities. 5.2 In the north-east refugee camps, closely monitor the coping strategies adopted by women, and those adopted by men, in adapting to the reductions in rations. 	Accepted	The country office with the support of the regional bureau will develop a gender transformation programme drawing on the experiences and lessons from other countries who have already embarked on this process. Similar to the programme underway in South Sudan, the Chad programme will seek to address gender within the context of the office environment and gender issues across all programme activities. The 3PA referenced in recommendation 2 will contribute to this work, as programmes are identified by vulnerability profiles and gender.	CO Management /Programme	March 2017	0
5.3 Conduct a systematic analysis of women's benefits of the FFA activities in terms of protection and/or asset creation.		The country office will recruit a National Gender Specialist to support the implementation of the gender transformation project. The country office with the support of the regional bureau		December 2016	
5.4 Develop and implement a human resources strategy, allowing field teams to		(Protection Specialist) will develop a road map to			

better understand and take into account	strengthen current APP and monitoring tools and	December
gender issues: recruitment, online gender	mechanisms and address gaps in respect of FFA activities.	2016
training, training on qualitative and		
participatory methods, CO staff involvement	In addition to the aforementioned gender transformation	
in the "Behind the Fence" campaign	project, all WFP staff and partners will be tasked to	
in the beam a the renee campaign in	complete the online training modules "I Know Gender";	
5.5 Follow-up on the implementation of the	and "I Know Gender in Emergencies".	
recommendations related to food assistance		
done in the Gender Evaluation, May 2014	The country office will mark the 25 th of each month with a	
(see annex 8-e).	reminder of the Zero Tolerance Policy against Sexual	
	Exploitation and Abuse.	
	A number of recommendations from the 2014 gender	
	assessment were taken into account in the	
	implementation of the PRRO. This includes strengthening	
	the targeting of women, particularly in resilience and	
	food-assistance-for-asset (FFA) activities; adapt the	
	schedule of FFA to the calendar of activities for women so	
	they are not overburdened; use participatory community	
	planning to encourage the involvement of women in	
	decision-making as relates to food assistance; ensure the	
	safety of beneficiaries through the choice of safe	
	distribution sites and distribution timing. The CO will	
	continue implementation of the recommendations through: scaling-up of beneficiary feedback and complaint	
	mechanisms, starting in regions where cash-based	
	transfers are being implemented, and progressively	
	scaling up to all WFP activities, taking into account	
	existing initiatives by partners; build questions linked to	
	beneficiary preferences for food assistance (in-kind vs.	
	vouchers vs. cash) into monitoring tools and regularly	
	follow-up to ensure that mitigating measures are	
	implemented if preferences cannot be taken into account	
	(protection, sensitization, beneficiary feedback	
	mechanisms).	

Recommandation 6:	Accepted				
 Transform M&E into a genuine tool to support WFP's strategic steering of interventions in Chad 6.1 Continue the implementation of the measures defined early 2016, with the support of the RB, to improve the situation regarding activity monitoring, data management and reporting. 6.2 Adjust the M&E system to support strategic decision-making and steering of interventions. 		Work is underway to transform the quality of M+E to support programme strategy and direction The country office is in the process of rolling out COMET, the corporate M+E tool. The country office is implementing the recommendations defined in early 2016 with the support of the regional bureau. The country office is increasing the use of smartphones/ tablets to improve timeliness and quality of data collection. The country office has increased the frequency and quality of PDMs. The country office will implement a quarterly comprehensive M+E report for management to inform decision making.	CO Management /Programme/M&E	Starting end September 2016	0
Recommandation 7: Prepare a 1-year extension for the PRRO and	Accepted	The country office will present a 1-year extension to the	CO Management	November	
 then a country strategy 7.1 Before the end of 2016, prepare a PRRO extension integrating the above short term recommendations. 7.2 During 2017, prepare a country strategy integrating the medium and long term recommendations and focusing specifically on i) strengthening partnerships, ii) leadership and national partners' ownership, and iii) the 		PRRO, to the Executive Board in November 2016. The country office will prepare a country strategic plan in 2017. The plan will be underpinned by a comprehensive Zero Hunger Analysis. The 3PA (referenced in recommendation 2 above) will represent a important part of the preparatory work. Aligned with the corporate approach and guidelines, the CSP preparatory work and	/HoU	2016 November 2017	US\$100,000

required changes to the CO organisation and architecture (number of sub-CO, staff profile,	subsequent CSP will focus on support to national strategies, nationally owned solutions, and partnerships. The country office with the support of the regional bureau will undertake a structural review as part of the CSP preparatory work. 	June 2017	