

برنامج
الأغذية
العالمي



Programme
Alimentaire
Mondial

World
Food
Programme

Programa
Mundial
de Alimentos

**Executive Board
First Regular Session**

Rome, 18–19 February 2013

EVALUATION REPORTS

Agenda item 6

For consideration

E

Distribution: GENERAL

WFP/EB.1/2013/6-A/Add.1

11 January 2013

ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

MANAGEMENT RESPONSE TO THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SUMMARY REPORT OF THE JOINT UNHCR/WFP IMPACT EVALUATION ON THE CONTRIBUTION OF FOOD ASSISTANCE TO DURABLE SOLUTIONS IN PROTRACTED REFUGEE SITUATIONS – CHAD

NOTE TO THE EXECUTIVE BOARD

This document is submitted to the Executive Board for consideration.

The Secretariat invites members of the Board who may have questions of a technical nature with regard to this document to contact the WFP staff focal points indicated below, preferably well in advance of the Board's meeting.

Director, RMP*	Mr C. Kaye	tel.: 066513-2197
Senior Programme Adviser, OS**	Mr P. Rodrigues	tel.: 066513-2361
Programme Adviser, RMP	Ms K. Oppusunggu	tel.: 066513-3068

Should you have any questions regarding availability of documentation for the Executive Board, please contact Ms I. Carpitella, Senior Administrative Assistant, Conference Servicing Unit (tel.: 066513-2645).

* Performance Management and Monitoring Division

** Operations Services Department

BACKGROUND

1. This is one of the four impact evaluations jointly commissioned by the WFP Office of Evaluation and the Policy Development and Evaluation Service of the Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR). It assesses the impact of food assistance for refugees from the Central African Republic since their arrival in southern Chad in 2002.
2. The evaluation identifies lessons regarding the contribution of food assistance to sustainable solutions for the refugees. WFP and UNHCR welcome the recommendations, which are intended over the long term to improve programme management and the monitoring and evaluation of food assistance, nutrition and protection activities.
3. The Secretariat's responses to the recommendations are presented in the attached matrix.

**MANAGEMENT RESPONSE TO THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SUMMARY REPORT
OF THE JOINT UNHCR/WFP IMPACT EVALUATION ON THE CONTRIBUTION OF FOOD ASSISTANCE
TO DURABLE SOLUTIONS IN PROTRACTED REFUGEE SITUATIONS – CHAD**

Recommendations	Action by	Management response and action taken	Implementation deadline
Longer-term strategies and durable solutions			
<p>Recommendation 1: UNHCR should lead the formulation of a consensus among those providing assistance to refugees on a strategy for the transition to self-reliance. Such a strategy should: be defined with the concerned relief and development actors in the host area; set realistic goals for self-reliance and integration given the local context; and acknowledge that in certain contexts such as Chad where the population lives below assistance thresholds, self-reliance will imply a worsening of refugees' living conditions. Failing to recognize this will continue to result in incoherent action and lack of consensus among partners.</p>	UNHCR	<p>Agreed.</p> <p>A strategy developed by UNHCR for the transition to self-reliance was validated at a workshop in Moundou in south-western Chad in February 2012. From 2013 to 2016, humanitarian support for the improvement of livelihoods and self-reliance among refugees from the Central African Republic in southern Chad will gradually be reduced.</p> <p>The strategy will be validated with other partners during the first quarter of 2013.</p>	<p>Implemented</p> <p>March 2013</p>
<p>Recommendation 2: WFP and UNHCR should pursue alternative and complementary activities to general food distribution (GFD) congruent with self-reliance objectives.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ WFP should consider urgently the introduction of food assistance modalities such as cash and vouchers, food for work, school feeding programmes or vulnerable group feeding as alternatives to GFD. ➤ UNHCR should enhance its support for traditional livelihoods (agriculture) and increase alternative and complementary activities that have proven effective locally (vegetable gardening, irrigated rice cultivation, soil fertility replenishment, income-generating activities and training). 	<p>WFP and UNHCR</p> <p>WFP</p> <p>UNHCR</p>	<p>Agreed.</p> <p>Both organizations are committed to providing food distributions as part of the self-reliance strategy, along with cash-based alternatives to complement them.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ A pilot cash-and-voucher project is planned for launch in 2013. ➤ Identification of more partners with the technical and financial capacity to supervise food-for-work and cash-for-work activities for the refugees and the host population. ➤ The joint assessment mission (JAM) in November/December 2012 will include discussion of the targeting of vulnerable refugees and of the option to introduce school feeding for refugee children in primary schools. <p>The programme started in 2009 to promote self-reliance and self-sufficiency will continue, but new techniques for improving soil fertility and the distribution of fertilizers are expected to enhance sustainable use of resources in agriculture, livestock-rearing and income-generation.</p>	<p>By the end of 2013</p> <p>February 2013</p> <p>December 2012</p> <p>September 2013</p>



**MANAGEMENT RESPONSE TO THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SUMMARY REPORT
OF THE JOINT UNHCR/WFP IMPACT EVALUATION ON THE CONTRIBUTION OF FOOD ASSISTANCE
TO DURABLE SOLUTIONS IN PROTRACTED REFUGEE SITUATIONS – CHAD**

Recommendations	Action by	Management response and action taken	Implementation deadline
Recommendation 3: UNHCR should formulate specific criteria for selecting camp locations taking self-reliance objectives into account. This will help local authorities to select appropriate sites and avoid the need for refugees to relocate.	UNHCR	Agreed. Such criteria exist and were applied in siting the Belom camp: selection based on consolidated terms of reference was conducted by a team that included local authorities, the <i>Commission nationale pour l'accueil et la réinsertion des réfugiés et des rapatriés</i> (CNARR, National Commission for the Reception and Reinsertion of Refugees and Returnees), various UNHCR technical staff and a private cartography firm.	Implemented
Recommendation 4: UNHCR and CNARR should monitor refugee movements more closely and facilitate spontaneous returns of refugees to their countries of origin. UNHCR and CNARR should improve their monitoring and understanding of the motives of refugee movements. UNHCR should encourage CNARR to officially authorize cross-border movements and should support refugee visits to their countries of origin to assess conditions and take informed decisions concerning their return. Finally, WFP and UNHCR should enhance coordination with their respective programmes in the Central African Republic to prevent double-dipping.	UNHCR and CNARR	Agreed. Sudanese refugees in eastern Chad: in July 2012 refugee leaders from the 12 camps in eastern Chad and the Sudanese authorities met in the presence of the Chadian authorities and UNHCR to discuss the return of Sudanese refugees to Darfur. The refugee representatives raised conditions regarding security and respect for human rights that were to be met before the refugees' return. In the same month, the UNHCR Sudan and Chad offices exchanged information on cross-border movements. Observation visits to West Darfur are planned for early 2013. Refugees from the Central African Republic in southern Chad: in 2012, the UNHCR Chad and Central African Republic offices discussed cross-border movements at two meetings. Information about spontaneous returns to the Ouham Pende region was made available by the Central African Republic office. The UNHCR Chad database has been regularly updated to identify those who have returned.	Implemented July 2013
	WFP and UNHCR	Information about returnees will be exchanged regularly between the UNHCR and WFP offices in the Central African Republic: this will include information from the Central African Republic about feeding programmes close to the Chad border, which are potential sources of double-dipping by refugees in Chad. Double-dippers will be identified and corrective measures will be taken. The master lists of refugees will be updated each month to take into account the refugees who have returned to the Central African Republic or relocated.	January 2013 onwards Ongoing



**MANAGEMENT RESPONSE TO THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SUMMARY REPORT
OF THE JOINT UNHCR/WFP IMPACT EVALUATION ON THE CONTRIBUTION OF FOOD ASSISTANCE
TO DURABLE SOLUTIONS IN PROTRACTED REFUGEE SITUATIONS – CHAD**

Recommendations	Action by	Management response and action taken	Implementation deadline
<p>Recommendation 5: WFP and UNHCR policy and programme support offices at global level should take note of recommendations 1 to 4, which are likely to be applicable in displacement contexts beyond Chad where self-reliance objectives are formulated. It is particularly important that in the first years after displacement UNHCR lead formulation of a consensual strategy for the transition to self-reliance and that WFP introduces food assistance modalities alternative to GFD early on so as to support rapid withdrawal from GFD.</p>	<p>WFP Division of Policy and Programme Innovation; UNHCR Division of Programme Support and Management and Policy Development and Evaluation Service</p>	<p>Agreed. The transition to self-reliance requires a phased approach and agreed benchmarks to reduce food assistance. The following factors affecting implementation should be addressed jointly:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ lack of technical capacities for implementing comprehensive self-reliance strategies and for effective oversight and monitoring; ➤ insufficient funding for UNHCR self-reliance programming; and ➤ government policies on issues such as the right to work, freedom of movement and access to land. <p>WFP and UNHCR will decide jointly on the introduction of alternative food-assistance modalities in the context of the transition strategy.</p>	<p>Ongoing</p>
<p>Programme Implementation</p>			
<p>Recommendation 6: WFP and UNHCR should enhance the management, monitoring and evaluation of assistance.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Monitoring systems should be enhanced to allow for better-informed decision-making. ➤ Given diverging opinions between WFP and UNHCR on the phasing out of GFD, a JAM mission should be conducted soon. Systematic close monitoring of refugees' food security situation and their access to basic services should be undertaken when GFD is reduced or discontinued. 	<p>WFP and UNHCR</p>	<p>Agreed. Post-distribution monitoring was carried out in 2011 and 2012. The JAM is ongoing.</p> <p>WFP and UNHCR had the same concern. Under an improved system put in place in April 2012, post-distribution monitoring reports were by November providing more complete information for decision-makers.</p> <p>Annual joint nutrition evaluations of refugees and host populations will continue.</p> <p>Specific monitoring of the impact of changes to the level of assistance will enhance understanding of their impact.</p> <p>The 2012 JAM was carried out in November and December 2012.</p>	<p>Implemented</p> <p>Implemented</p> <p>December 2012</p> <p>Whenever rations are changed December 2012</p>



**MANAGEMENT RESPONSE TO THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SUMMARY REPORT
OF THE JOINT UNHCR/WFP IMPACT EVALUATION ON THE CONTRIBUTION OF FOOD ASSISTANCE
TO DURABLE SOLUTIONS IN PROTRACTED REFUGEE SITUATIONS – CHAD**

Recommendations	Action by	Management response and action taken	Implementation deadline
<p>Recommendation 7: WFP and UNHCR should promote enhanced use of food rations by beneficiaries by respecting the Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) clauses concerning UNHCR provision of fresh foods and WFP facilitation of cereal milling. The frequency of GFD distributions should also be harmonized across the camps and two-month distributions avoided.</p>	WFP and UNHCR	<p>Agreed.</p> <p>WFP will review the cost to refugees of cereal milling and its impact on the level of assistance received compared with refugees' assessed needs; this applies particularly in the case of vulnerable refugees to ensure that they receive appropriate assistance.</p> <p>The timing of monthly distributions will be harmonized in all camps, in line with the availability of UNHCR funding.</p>	<p>End of March 2013</p> <p>March 2013</p>
<p>Recommendation 8: Protection.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ UNHCR should set up a monitoring system to track the occurrence and development of protection issues, particularly those related to gender-based violence. ➤ UNHCR should also seek to reduce post-distribution conjugal violence; provide alternative income-generating options to women brewing alcohol; and avoid exclusion errors especially of women in the category of persons with special needs (PSNs). ➤ UNHCR should advocate for increased engagement of relevant actors including other United Nations agencies and the Government to address specific protection issues, including those linked to the conflicts between farmers and herders. 	UNHCR	<p>Agreed.</p> <p>Community-based mechanisms are in place in all camps to identify protection issues. Committees on sexual and gender-based violence (SGBV) meet in each camp to identify incidents and refer those affected to medical, legal and social services. Monthly or fortnightly coordination meetings enable those concerned, including local authorities, to coordinate their responses; SGBV awareness-raising campaigns and group discussions are organized for refugees.</p> <p>UNHCR and its partners provide income-generating activities for vulnerable women and those affected by SGBV.</p> <p>An awareness-raising campaign on post-distribution conjugal violence was conducted in Farchana in October 2012; such sessions were extended to all refugee camps in November 2012, and will continue on a quarterly basis.</p> <p>Committees of refugee and host representatives promote peaceful resolution of conflicts and address individual incidents. Awareness-raising campaigns are organized by UNHCR, its partners and local authorities to promote peaceful coexistence between refugees and host communities, especially after rainy seasons when herders migrate with their animals. UNHCR will continue to advocate with local authorities to address these protection issues.</p>	<p>Implemented</p> <p>Implemented</p> <p>Implemented</p>



**MANAGEMENT RESPONSE TO THE RECOMMENDATIONS OF THE SUMMARY REPORT
OF THE JOINT UNHCR/WFP IMPACT EVALUATION ON THE CONTRIBUTION OF FOOD ASSISTANCE
TO DURABLE SOLUTIONS IN PROTRACTED REFUGEE SITUATIONS – CHAD**

Recommendations	Action by	Management response and action taken	Implementation deadline
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Finally, donors should continue funding the <i>Détachement intégré de sécurité</i> (DIS, Integrated Security Detachment) as long as there are refugees from the Central African Republic. 	UNHCR and WFP, with donors	<p>Funding for DIS was difficult in 2012 and remains a challenge for 2013. Both agencies will continue to advocate for funding with donors.</p> <p>UNHCR and WFP will provide regular updates on insecure areas to facilitate decisions on travel security and enhance DIS services.</p>	Ongoing Ongoing
<p>Recommendation 9: UNHCR should enhance the relevance of nutrition strategies and improve their implementation and monitoring.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ UNHCR should adopt a flexible, context-specific approach and formulate a specific public health strategy for Dosseye, where acute and global malnutrition rates are higher than in the other camps and deserve particular attention. This should include robust nutrition-promotion actions targeting mothers and fathers. ➤ A strategy to combat anaemia should also be formulated and active monthly screening for malnutrition of all children under 5 should be implemented in all camps to improve the identification of malnourished children. ➤ UNHCR should ensure that nutrition surveys are conducted during the same period of the year to improve analysis of changes in malnutrition. ➤ To improve the management and implementation of nutrition activities, WFP and UNHCR should invest in developing the technical competencies of their own and partners' staff; UNHCR should establish medium-term partnerships with specialists in the prevention and treatment of malnutrition, with a view to reducing high partner turnover rates. 	UNHCR WFP and UNHCR	<p>Agreed.</p> <p>Refugees in Dosseye camp are pastoralists with limited knowledge of or affinity for agriculture. Traditional practices continue despite substantial changes in camp life. A strategy for Dosseye will be formulated.</p> <p>In 2011 UNHCR developed guidelines on the use of special nutritional products with a view to reducing anaemia and malnutrition among the refugees.</p> <p>UNHCR is conducting annual surveys to monitor the nutritional status of the refugee population, but access to some camps is a challenge during rainy seasons.</p> <p>WFP will deploy more nutritionists. UNHCR and WFP will each establish a plan to increase competence in nutrition among generalist staff. UNHCR and WFP will establish medium-term partnerships with the Government and with non-governmental organizations with capacity in prevention and treatment of malnutrition. UNHCR and WFP will develop a joint plan for augmenting partners' capacity in nutrition.</p>	 April 2013 Implemented Implemented July 2013 March 2013 August 2013 March 2013



ACRONYMS USED IN THE DOCUMENT

CNARR	<i>Commission nationale pour l'accueil et la réinsertion des réfugiés et des rapatriés</i> (National Commission for the Reception and Reinsertion of Refugees and Returnees)
DIS	<i>Détachement intégré de sécurité</i> (Integrated Security Detachment)
GFD	general food distribution
JAM	joint assessment mission
SGBV	sexual and gender-based violence
UNHCR	Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees