

OPERATION EVALUATION

Egypt Country Programme 200238 Leveraging National Capacity through Partnerships for Food and Nutrition Security (2013-2017): A mid-term evaluation of WFP's operation from August 2015-July 2016

Management Response

[July, 2016]



World Food Programme

wfp.org

Management response cleared by:

Country Director: Menghestab Haile/ July 13, 2016

Detailed responses to evaluation recommendations

Evaluation Recommendations	Management	Management - Action to be taken			
	Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
Recommendation 1: 1a. Develop an updated strategic vision for WFP Egypt that underscores its unique role as a flexible source of technical assistance and advisor to the Government of Egypt in the areas of food and nutritional security.	Accepted	1a. In the context of WFP's new corporate planning cycle for the period 2017-2021 and the recommendations of the Evaluation team, WFP's Country Office in Egypt (CO Egypt) will be recruiting an international consultant to develop CO Egypt's Country Program for the corresponding period. In all these processes, the CO is currently- and will continue- to maintain a solid dialogue with the different ministries and key government institutions to make sure that the national interests are reflected in these documents.	Management through the Country Director and the Programme Unit with RB support.	Consultant will be recruited by September 31, 2016. First draft of the Country Strategy will be finalized by February 28, 2017.	N
1b. WFP Egypt Country Director with the support from the senior management team, technical focal points and RB should form a task force to lead and prepare this strategy document to feed into the process of developing a post-2017 CP.	Accepted	1b. With the preparation for the Country Strategy -and eventually the new Country Programme, the CD will establish a Country taskforce to support the consultant and will ensure that regular coordination is taking place with the RB team.	Management through the Country Director.	Country Taskforce to be established after the appointment of the consultant by October 30, 2016 to develop the strategy and to support the hired consultant.	N

Evaluation Recommendations	Management	Management - Action to be taken			
	Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
<p>Recommendation 2:</p> <p>2a. Develop and implement an integration strategy with a pilot integrative community-focused programme to promote synergies between activities and partners.</p> <p>o In order to maximize the effects of programme activities WFP Egypt should develop and implement an integration strategy to promote synergies between programmes and partners and take advantage of these opportunities to increase efficiency and effectiveness but also programme impact.</p>	Accepted	2a. The CO head of programme together with the External relations unit will establish a team to jointly develop the integration strategy to promote synergies between different CO programmes and partners and take advantage of these opportunities to increase efficiency and effectiveness but also programme impact.	The Head of Programme Unit with the support of recommended technical team.	Strategy to be developed by December 31, 2016.	N
<p>2b. WFP initiate a pilot programme in integrative community-focused programming under Component 2 in Upper Egypt governorates. Under this initiative, community residents will participate in a needs-assessment activity centered around the community school. A technical team formed with staff from the SF, Vulnerability Analysis and Mapping, Climate Change, Nutrition and M&E units should work on the design of this pilot activity by the end of 2016 to start piloting in 2017. This recommendation will require strong</p>	Accepted	<p>2b. WFP CO has already begun preparations for a convergence pilot to be implemented in Sohag governorate (since it is the only governorate where all the CO interventions/activities take place SF/FFA/CBT/ schools rehabilitation/teachers training).</p> <p>The CO established a team led by the head of programme with the involvement of other recommended units by the Evaluation team.</p>	The Head of Programme Unit with the support of the recommended technical team	Pilot to start by January 31, 2017.	N

Evaluation Recommendations	Management	Management - Action to be taken			
	Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
institutional partnerships with Government of Egypt, United Nations agencies such as UNICEF, and partner non-governmental organisations.		The pilot would also explore complementary activities with (and alongside) the other governmental efforts on social protection (such as conditional cash transfers, subsidy system etc).			
Recommendation 3: 3a. Design an internal capacity building framework that responds to the needs of governmental focal entities and nongovernmental institutions in order to augment their capacities to design, implement, and assess food security priorities.	Accepted	3a. WFP has already started to develop an internal capacity building framework to identify those where it needs to augment its capacity to further build on its operations.	The Head of the Programme Unit with the Internal Capacity Working Group.	To be delivered by February 28, 2017.	N
3b. The Country Director should define an internal working group to develop this framework by the end of the first quarter of 2017.	Accepted	3b.The CO will establish an internal Capacity Building Working Group to be headed by the head of programme to consolidate all capacity building needs of the government, as well as cooperating partners. This will eventually be reflected in a capacity framework document.	Management through the Country Director alongside the Head of Programme Unit.	The internal working group will be established by December 31, 2016.	N

Evaluation Recommendations	Management	Management - Action to be taken			
	Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
Recommendation 4: 4a. Develop and implement a fund-raising plan to fund the CO development portfolio.	Accepted	4a. The CO External Relations unit has already mapped current and potential partners (traditional and non-traditional). The next step will be developing a fundraising plan and associated strategy.	Management through, WFP Egypt Country Director with support from the External Relations Unit	The funding plan to be completed by December 31, 2016.	N
4b. Under the leadership of the Country Director, WFP CO should conduct a corporate review of funding instruments and consider the provision of a funding mechanism that invests in research into new approaches, programme design, and proposal development.	Accepted	4b. The CO is also planning to additionally recruit a Private Sector Officer who should support in developing this new strategy. Continuous coordination with the RB team will be also ensured throughout the entire process.	Management through, WFP Egypt Country Director with support from the External Relations Unit	The recruitment of a Private Sector Officer is to be completed by January 31, 2017. The developed strategy would be completed by March 31, 2017.	N

Evaluation Recommendations	Management	Management - Action to be taken			
	Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
Recommendation 5: 5a. Extend the duration and strategically scale up the climate change programming in planned governorates.	Accepted	5a. The Climate Adaptation and Livelihood Unit is currently in contact with the Climate Change Unit in HQ on developing an extension request which is to be later forwarded to the donor. For scaling up, the project shall be working on documenting the different best practices, how they were done, challenges faced, and lessons learned. This will be then shared among the different stakeholders for upscaling. The project shall also be working on showcasing the different successful interventions to the concerned governmental entities as a means to advocate for their mainstreaming in the national agricultural strategies.	Climate Adaptation and Livelihood Unit	Submission for an extension request has already been made on July 4, 2016 to the Adaptation Fund World. Awaiting reply by October 30, 2016 to start implementation right after.	Y
5b. The project management should be strengthened in terms of staffing, staff capacity building, M&E system and managerial procedures.	Accepted	5b. Upon the endorsement of the extension, the project shall undertake a review of its current structure and accordingly propose changes/ amendments as needed. The project shall also undertake a capacity building assessment and accordingly develop a development plan for its staff. A digital database has been developed for recording of beneficiaries and outputs. An M&E system shall be developed by the end of 2016 to complement this digital database.	Climate Adaptation and Livelihood Unit	No later than December 31, 2016.	Y

Evaluation Recommendations	Management	Management - Action to be taken			
	Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
5c. A comprehensive dissemination strategy should be developed in order to upscale the adoption of project practices so as to widely cover the project governorates.	Accepted	5c. Upon the endorsement of the extension, the project shall develop a dissemination strategy that highlights what knowledge products are to be produced, the key messages of each, the target audience associated as well as the best available means to reach them.	Climate Adaptation and Livelihood Unit	Submission for an extension request has already been made on July 4, 2016 to the Adaptation Fund World. Awaiting reply by October 30, 2016 to start implementation no later than March 30, 2017.	Y
5d. The project should <u>NOT</u> expand geographically in more villages in response to beneficiaries or official requests (in the last months, four villages that were not included in the project document have been added to the target area). Taking into consideration the managerial capacity and the fact that various planned activities in the original project area are behind schedule, geographical expansion in the remaining project duration (even if extended) would	Rejected	5d. The Climate Adaptation and Livelihood Unit is going to study the expansion according to the terms set out by the project document. The project needs to expand to neighbouring villages because 1) the capacity to absorb more activities/ beneficiaries in many villages of the project document have already been reached. To reach the targets, the project will thus have to extend some of its services to other villages. 2) As per the project document, Component 2 aims to upscale and replicate the successful activities of Component 1 throughout the Southern Zone.	Climate Adaptation and Livelihood Unit	End of the CP December 31, 2017.	N

Evaluation Recommendations	Management	Management - Action to be taken			
	Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
negatively affect the quality and quantity of the project's targeted results.		Extending to neighbouring villages will be one of the major means to achieve this. Where a need is identified, staffing capacity shall be augmented by the hire of additional staff.			
Recommendation 6: 6a. Strengthen gender analysis in programme design and implementation. o More attention should be paid to gender mainstreaming as a cross-cutting issue among all interventions and not only where women are the targeted beneficiaries.	Accepted	6a. There is already the Gender Results Network (GRN), with a specific TOR, in place in the Egypt CO. An Action Plan for gender mainstreaming (2016-2020) has already been developed and is planned to be discussed before the end of 2016 with Egypt CO GRN and RBC to ensure that the activities will be carried out by each designated responsible actor. Egypt CO has already agreed to participate in the first phase of WFP's gender transformation programme.	Management through the Deputy Country Director with the support of the Programme Unit	For Management endorsement by December 31, 2016 to effectively plan programme activities by June 01, 2017.	N
6b. Conduct gender analysis before, during and after implementing interventions, planning more gender-specific activities, applying gender budgeting, the disaggregation of data by gender, considering gender ratios in staffing (the last two elements are widely considered), as well as	Partially Accepted	6b. Both M&E and VAM CO units will include gender measures in their assessments, analysis and project design (monitoring data collection tools have already been revised). The CO gender Action Plan currently has four main activities, each one requires further	Management through the Deputy Country Director with	For further activities to be implemented starting June 01,	N

Evaluation Recommendations	Management	Management - Action to be taken			
	Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
developing gender-specific indicators tailored to the respective intervention and targeted groups.		preparation and budget planning to be addressed and developed in early 2017.	the support of the Programme Unit in immediate collaboration with both VAM and M&E units	2017 through August 2017.	
6c. As soon as possible, the CO should take needed steps to adopt in its plans two important documents which were developed by the CO in 2015, however not yet seriously taken into consideration,	Accepted	6c. The CO Action plan for gender has already adopted both the 'Gender Mainstreaming Action Plan WFP CO 2015-2017, as well as the 'Concept Note-Preliminary Gender Map of Egypt Country Office.' Programme Officers will meet as 2016 progresses in planning for implementation in 2017.	Management through the Deputy Country Director with the support of the Programme Unit.	Document revision to take place by December 31, 2016.	N
6d. "Checklist for Gender Self-Assessment" developed by the CO should be considered in the projects' design, implementation and results.	Accepted	6d. A gender self-assessment checklist for projects was developed and shared with WFP CO Programme Officers. The checklist allows each unit to examine project performance from a gender perspective. The checklist further allows reflection on different gender aspects and determine if they are available/considered in the three project phases: 1) context and needs assessment, 2) implementation, 3) results.	Management through the Deputy Country Director with the support of the Programme Unit.	Document revision to take place by December 31, 2016.	N

Evaluation Recommendations	Management	Management - Action to be taken			
	Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
6e. CO and project staff should receive relevant training on gender equality and empowerment of women concepts and efforts	Accepted	6e. Both GRN and GTP will address the relevant trainings to be taken by staff. In addition, as part of the gender action plan a training plan will be drafted and developed by the gender committee (once established). WFP online class 'I know gender' will be recommended for the staff.	Management through the Deputy Country Director with the support of the Programme Unit.	Training of CO staff and will take place by October 31, 2017.	N
6f. An institutional set-up in charge of gender mainstreaming (e.g., hiring a gender specialist, creating a gender unit and/or building a gender task force) is recommended as an alternative to the current situation, where gender issues are an additional (and de-facto secondary) mandate of already overloaded personnel.	Partially Accepted	6f. As per the aforementioned action, the GRN will serve in this function to mainstream gender activities.	Management through the Deputy Country Director with the support of the Programme Unit and immediate collaboration with the CO gender focal point	For activities to be implemented with a start date of June 01, 2017 through August 2017.	N
6g. The Country Director should form a Gender Committee to address this	Partially Accepted	6g. The Gender Results Network (GRN) will serve to address recommendation.	Management through the Deputy Country	A GRN will address this recommendation	N

Evaluation Recommendations	Management	Management - Action to be taken			
	Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
recommendation, to be implemented before the end of 2016.			Director with the GRN.	by December 31, 2016.	
Recommendation 7: 7a. Prepare a plan of activities to augment the capacity needed to implement Component 4 and to jump-start nutritional activities. WFP should focus on programme activities particularly related to capacity building, fortification, and training and curricula development to jump-start nutrition activities.	Accepted	7a. A Nutrition Officer was hired mid-2016. There are currently a number of activities taking place to augment the capacity of the unit. A partnership with MoHP is underway, the project concept note has been prepared and submitted to them and WFP CO is currently planning for a meeting and approval from them in order to launch our KFW funded '1000 days of life' project in Sohag and Fayoum on the Primary Healthcare (PHC) level. Current finalizing of the agreement to be signed between the 2 CDs of WFP and UNICEF regarding the framework of our joint collaboration is in the process. De-worming activities (including treatment and nutrition education) are set to start given recent MoE approval of WFP CO activities.	Nutrition Unit	Mapping of the project to be completed by December 31, 2016; for launch to take place on January 30, 2017.	N
Recommendation 8: 8a. Review the CO operational structure with regard to relationships between technical units, support units, and the external relations unit as follow-up to ongoing internal process.	Accepted	8a. WFP CO has already started implementing this recommendation given the recommendations advocated by the SSR that occurred in early 2016.	Management through the Country Director with the support of the HR unit.	Ongoing (over three phases and to be finalized by December 31, 2016)	N

Evaluation Recommendations	Management	Management - Action to be taken			
	Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
<p>8b. It is recommended specifically that the CO review the functions of each unit to clarify roles and responsibilities, empower technical focal points, and enhance communication between technical focal points and respective counterparts in the government.</p> <p>o The Country Director, with the support of the senior management, technical focal points, as well as the RB, should continue the ongoing process that involves internal coordination seminars to review enactment of new structures and processes.</p> <p>.</p>	Accepted	8b. Reviewing, restructuring and recruitment of newly recommended positions is currently underway and should be finalized over three phases.	Management through the Country Director with the support of the HR unit.	Ongoing (over three phases and to be finalized by December 31, 2016)	N
<p>8c. Conduct a review seminar prior to the formulation of the new CP</p>	Accepted	8c. Upon the recruitment of the consultant and the establishment of the committee which will be responsible for developing the new CP, a review participatory seminar will be organized.	Management through the Country Director with the support of the Consultant.	To be completed by November 30, 2016.	N
<p>Recommendation 9:</p> <p>9a. Expand the decision support capacity of the Monitoring and Evaluation system with a</p>	Accepted	9a. The M&E unit will continue developing its regular outcome monitoring exercises, in addition, and based on the recent evaluation report, the M&E unit introduced a new activity monitoring tool (Field	Monitoring and Evaluation Unit	To be completed by December 31, 2016.	N

Evaluation Recommendations	Management	Management - Action to be taken			
	Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
<p>review of current indicators and how to improve their incorporation into programme management.</p> <p>o To build upon the recent, innovative restructuring of the M&E data management system, WFP Egypt M&E unit should now seek to enhance the decision support capability of the system by reviewing the incorporation of the M&E products into programme management.</p>		monitoring observations' matrix). This will be an additional bi-monthly product that would enhance operational monitoring whereby the programme units will be requested to provide instant feedback on the observations highlighted and the corrective measures to be taken. The matrix and the actions taken by the programme units will be discussed in the weekly heads of units meeting to ensure a better decision support function to the programme management.			
<p>9b. The evaluation team recommends a review of the indicator lists associated with programme components to assess how each indicator supports programme management. It further recommends the inclusion of project-specific indicators that assess the outcomes of programme activities more clearly.</p>	Accepted	9b. The M&E unit will continue to revise and update its monitoring toolkits to reflect corporate requirements and to include project specific indicators that assess the outcomes of programme activities more clearly.	Monitoring and Evaluation Unit	To be completed by December 31, 2016.	N
<p>9c. It is recommended that in 2016, the M&E unit engage in a series of workshops with the technical units and cooperating partners to establish how current M&E products and indicators can more effectively support programme design and operations and to define a set of unit-specific outcome</p>	Accepted	9c. The M&E staff will continue collaborating with other CO units in training and building the capacity of the Cooperating partners on M&E best practices and products. This will mostly be done through field missions to the different governorates.	Monitoring and Evaluation Unit	To be completed by December 31, 2016.	N

Evaluation Recommendations	Management	Management - Action to be taken			
	Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
indicators that would support more rigorous and systematic assessment of effectiveness.					
9d. The evaluation team recommends a review of the current Strategic Results Framework to revise outcome indicators that provide insufficient information on programme effectiveness (e.g., retention rates and enrolment rates in SF) and as such they often reflect results from non-programme-related factors.	Accepted	9d. The review of the current Strategic Results Framework to revise outcome indicators that provide insufficient information on programme effectiveness is the responsibility of the RMP unit in HQ whereby they engage in a consultation process with all CO - M&E units. The CO M&E unit will abide by the indicators reflected in the final document.	Monitoring and Evaluation Unit	To be completed by December 31, 2016.	N
Recommendation 10: 10a. WFP Egypt should contribute to a revision of the M&E system of the National School Feeding Programme.	Accepted	10a. An International M&E consultant is currently in the process of assessing the system and will be developing a report with his recommendations on the system enhancement. The findings of this report will also feed into the development of a national school feeding strategy.	Monitoring and Evaluation Unit and School Feeding Unit	Has already been implemented as of June 1, 2016 and ongoing till December 31, 2016.	N
10b. It is further recommended that the revised system move beyond the current indicators of enrolment and attendance to include learning outcomes, primary completion rates and transition to secondary school rates.	Accepted	10b. An International M&E consultant is currently in the process of assessing the system and will be developing a report with his recommendations on the system enhancement. The M&E consultant will also propose a list of key indicators to enhance the M&E system. As for the inclusion of the learning outcomes, primary completion rates and transition to secondary school rates, these will be left to the M&E consultant to	Monitoring and Evaluation Unit and School Feeding Unit	Has already been implemented as of June 1, 2016 and ongoing till December 31, 2016.	N

Evaluation Recommendations	Management	Management - Action to be taken			
	Accepted, partially accepted or not accepted and COMMENT on the Recommendation, providing clear reasoning for partially accepted and not accepted	Action	Responsible CO unit	Timeframe	Further funding required (Y or N)
		advise on as it might be challenging to attribute pass rate/completion rate to school feeding interventions only.			
10 c. The SF unit in coordination with the M&E unit should develop a plan and strategy to support the Ministry of Education and Ministry of Social Solidarity during 2017.	Accepted	10c. The CO has already begun preparations for the development of this plan through assessing and supporting the M&E system as well as developing the national school feeding strategy.	Monitoring and Evaluation Unit and School Feeding Unit	M&E assessment is currently underway and will be followed by supporting the development of a national school feeding strategy by December 31, 2016.	N